



GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission 2B

Special Meeting Minutes

Thursday, May 16th, 2019; 7:00 p.m.
Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies
1619 Massachusetts Avenue NW

Call to Order

The special May 2019 meeting of the Dupont Circle Advisory Neighborhood Commission (Commission or ANC 2B) was called to order by Chair Daniel Warwick at 7:19 pm.

Introduction of Commissioners

The Commissioners identified their single member districts (SMDs). Present were: Matthew Sampson (2B01), Daniel Warwick (2B02), Lucky Barbieri (2B03), Aaron Landry (2B04), Randy Downs (2B05), Mike Silverstein (2B06), Kari Cunningham (2B07), Beverly Schwartz (2B08), and Ed Hanlon (2B09).

Announcements and Public Comments

Public Announcements and General Comments or Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Silverstein said that this year's Capital Pride Parade will begin at 4:30 pm on Saturday, June 8th. He said that the parade route has changed this year to begin at the intersection of 21st Street and P Street NW instead of at the intersection of 23rd Street and P Street NW. He also gave an overview of the additional funding that was added to DC's FY 2019 and FY 2020 budgets to provide accessibility services during ANC meetings.

Zoning, Preservation, and Development Agenda

1733 16th Street NW, Scottish Rite Temple – Historic Landmark Amendment (Boundary Expansion)

Commissioner Schwartz moved to adopt a proposed resolution regarding the matter. Commissioner Silverstein seconded the motion. Commissioner Schwartz moved to adopt a proposed amendment to the resolution to add a "Be It Resolved" clause requesting that the Historic Preservation Review Board (HPRB) resolves the questions regarding the boundaries of the current landmark. Commissioner Silverstein seconded the motion for the amendment. Commissioner Hanlon moved to adopt a proposed amendment to the amendment requesting that HPRB requests that the Mayor's Agent for Historic Preservation resolves the questions regarding the boundaries of the current landmark. The motion for the amendment to the amendment was not voted on due to the lack of a second. A roll call vote for the final motion regarding the

amendment was requested. The final motion regarding the amendment was voted on and did not pass (VOTES: 2-7-0). The roll call vote was as follows:

Commissioner Hanlon: Yea
Commissioner Silverstein: Nay
Commissioner Downs: Nay
Commissioner Cunningham: Nay
Commissioner Landry: Nay
Commissioner Sampson: Nay
Commissioner Barbieri: Nay
Commissioner Schwartz: Yea
Chair Warwick: Nay

The final motion regarding the resolution was voted on and passed (VOTES: 8-1-0). The resolution reads as follows:

WHEREAS, the structure of the Scottish Rite Temple is within the 16th Street Historic District with adjacent space within the 16th Street Historic District and the 14th Street Historic District,

WHEREAS, the Scottish Rite Temple is a designated DC historic landmark,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands that due to the method in which the site was landmarked in 1964, no specific boundaries were defined,

WHEREAS, the Dupont East Civic Action Association (DECAA; applicant) has submitted an application to the Historic Preservation Review Board requesting that the boundary of the Scottish Rite Temple historic landmark be extended eastward to include the entirety of Lot 108, reaching to 15th Street NW,

WHEREAS, the expansion will encompass land that is currently vacant, having been cleared of the dwellings formerly occupying it between 1920 and the early 1990s, and currently contains a landscaped space which is not open to the public,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B understands that the Supreme Council has engaged a developer to construct a residential apartment building on the space east of the temple, and

WHEREAS, upon public discussion ANC 2B believes that the application lacks the necessary research to support an expansion of the landmark designation.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B does not support the application.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B requests that the Historic Preservation Review Board clarify and resolve the specific site of the existing historic landmark.

1733 16th Street NW, Scottish Rite Temple – Concept / Four-Story Plus Penthouse New Apartment Building

Chair Warwick moved to adopt a proposed resolution regarding the matter. Commissioner Landry seconded the motion. Commissioner Schwartz moved to adopt a proposed amendment to the resolution to add a “Whereas” clause requesting that the applicant more closely adheres to HPRB’s original recommendations regarding the proposed building height and the views from 15th Street NW. Commissioner Hanlon seconded the motion for the amendment. A roll call vote for the motion regarding the amendment was requested. The motion regarding the amendment was voted on and did not pass (VOTES: 2-7-0). The roll call vote was as follows:

Commissioner Hanlon: Yea
Commissioner Silverstein: Nay
Commissioner Downs: Nay
Commissioner Cunningham: Nay
Commissioner Landry: Nay
Commissioner Sampson: Nay
Commissioner Barbieri: Nay
Commissioner Schwartz: Yea
Chair Warwick: Nay

The final motion regarding the resolution was voted on and passed (VOTES: 8-1-0). The resolution reads as follows:

WHEREAS, the project as proposed is within the 16th Street Historic District, the 14th Street Historic District, and Advisory Neighborhood Commission 2B,

WHEREAS, the project proposes to construct an apartment building on a currently vacant parcel at the corner of 15th Street and S Street NW, which was occupied by row houses more than 30 years ago,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates that the applicant has shared a light study to illuminate concerns regarding shadows from the proposed project,

WHEREAS, at the previous concept review for this project ANC 2B requested the following:

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to redesign the corner treatments to be more congruent with the row house nature of 15th Street and S Street.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B urges the applicant to rethink the window treatment on the carriage house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B encourages the applicant to consider a more muted color tone through yellow or light red bricks and to

simplify the design overall so that any variation in material and design is more subtle and more consistent with nearby properties.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that ANC 2B requests that changes in the concept review proposal go back through the Historic Preservation Review Board rather than be delegated to Historic Preservation Office staff so that the ANC may continue to formally weigh in on this project.

WHEREAS, ANC 2B appreciates that the applicant has responded to these concerns,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B further understands, based on Historic Preservation Review Board guidance, that the applicant has created a linear park between the proposed new development and the Masonic Temple in an area that roughly corresponds to the alley which historically existed in Square 192 before being vacated by the city,

WHEREAS, though ANC 2B understands that the alley was vacated by the city, the area of the landscaped linear park has historically served a circulation purpose,

WHEREAS, ANC 2B believes that separation between the new development and the historic landmark structure is vital to the contextual understanding of the two structures as of different times and uses, and

WHEREAS, ANC 2B believes that the contextual understanding of the differences between the structures is diminished by a physical barrier or gate bringing the two structures together by blocking the linear park from S Street NW or the alley.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that ANC 2B supports the project as proposed provided that no physical barriers are erected at the north and south ends of the linear park, abutting S Street NW and the alley.

Adjournment

Chair Warwick adjourned the meeting at 10:10 pm.